

Earl Haig debate – quotes challenge activity sheet.



Earl Haig - butcher or brilliant commander?

Look at the following pieces of information on Field Marshal Sir Douglas Haig (later made Earl Haig of Bemerseyde).

- Haig was Commander-in-Chief of the British Army fighting in France and Belgium for most of the Western Front. He was given the rank of Field Marshal, which meant he was not only in charge of many soldiers but also many generals and officers in the British Army.
- Since the First World War historians have argued about how good a commander Haig actually was.
- Some say he was a cruel commander who did not care for his men and sent many of them to their deaths needlessly. Thousands of men were killed in the trenches in the First World War and historians often blame Haig and his commanders for these deaths.
- Other historians say he was a brilliant commander who did well to win the First World War, especially given he had to use modern technology for the first time (for example the machine gun, tank and aeroplane).

Task 1 - Highlight or underline the key points on this sheet.

Task 2 - Read the quotes sheet which shows Historians views of Field Marshal Haig.

Task 3 - Once you have read and discussed each of them place them under the correct heading 'butcher' or 'brilliant commander'. You may write in your answers or cut and paste from the worksheet and stick into your jotter/folder.

Your Name

Your Class

Evidence for 'Haig was a butcher'	Evidence for 'Haig was a brilliant commander'